DYNAMICS OF JUDGES’ CONSIDERATIONS IN THE DETERMINATION OF MARRIAGE DISPENSATION AT THE ENREKANG RELIGION COURT

Nur Alam
KUA Kec. Baraka, Kab. Enrekang
E-mail: kuanuralam@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

The main study in this thesis is the dynamics of judges' considerations in determining the dispensation of marriage at the Enrekang Religious Court. Ideally, marriages are carried out in accordance with existing regulations, but there are still opportunities provided by the state for prospective brides and families/guardians of prospective brides who still wish to enter into underage marriages. Data at the Religious Court of Enrekang every year there has been an increase in marriage dispensation cases being handled in the last 4 years. In 2017, 35 cases were received, in 2018, 36 cases were received, but in 2019 there was a spike in cases as many as 42 cases, this was as a result of the enactment of Law no. 16 of 2019 and in 2020 as of July 10 2020 there have been 70 cases that have been submitted.

This type of research is field research qualitative research methods through normative juridical and sociological juridical approaches. The paradigm of this research is constructivist. Data source primary is the determination of marriage dispensation and the testimony of the judges, while secondary data comes from scientific books, accredited journals, theses, dissertations and documents related to the object of research.

The results of the study showed that (1) the discrepancy between the applicant's expectations and the request for a marriage dispensation was not granted in accordance with the Marriage Dispensation Stipulation of the Enrekang Religious Court, indicating that there was a social conflict contained in the stipulation. And the applicant still marries her child with her future husband but is not registered at the Office of Religious Affairs or married in an unregistered manner which will have a social impact because there is no recognition from the state, problems in managing population administration and others. (2) The factors considered by the judge in determining the dispensation for marriage at the Enrekang Religious Court are psychological, health, educational and economic factors. (3) The dynamics in determining the marriage dispensation at the Enrekang Religious Court can be seen in the determination of the marriage dispensation, differ from one case to another. Because sometimes judges differ in giving legal considerations to a case. If there is a difference of opinion in an assembly, a vote is made on the case by following the majority vote after going through deliberation. After the entry into force of PERMA No. 5 of 2019 which regulates the settlement of marriage dispensation cases is a single judge, this will reduce the complexity in examining and determining marriage dispensation. This provision has been enforced at the Enrekang Religious Court since the date of its stipulation. If there is a difference of opinion in an assembly, voting will be carried out on the case by following the majority vote after going through deliberation.

Keywords: Dynamics of Judge Consideration, Marriage Dispensation, Enrekang

1. INTRODUCTION

Marriage is something that is very urgent in human life, and is the main foundation in building a society. Thus marriage has a very important position in Islam because through marriage family life will be well organized which is the core of
community life which is in line with the position of humans as creatures of honor above other God's creatures.

Marriage is a commandment of Allah swt. and it was sunnah by Rasulullah saw. as a form of worship to Him so that we humans can be protected from disgraceful acts. Allah SWT. creating human beings in pairs from which they will give birth to the next generation or offspring, in order to maintain human survival.\(^1\) As the word of Allah swt. QS al-Zariyāh/51: 49.

Translation: "And we have created everything in pairs so that you may remember the greatness of Allah."\(^2\)

The bond between a man and a woman that is framed in a marriage must be based on a form of devotion to Allah SWT. as al-Khaliq (God the Creator) and in order to gain His pleasure. Marriage must also be based on the will and willingness of the parties concerned, this can be seen in the proposal, consent qobul, witness, guardian, dowry and walimah.\(^3\)

Such a marriage will give birth to a family that is sakinah (safe and peaceful), mawaddah (loves each other) and rahma (loves one another). This marriage will give birth to honorable offspring as the next generation who will maintain the continuity of human life in a good, clean and respectable manner. As the word of Allah swt. in QS al-Rūm/30: 21.

Translation: And among the signs of His power is that He has created for you wives of your own kind, so that you are inclined to and feel at ease with him, and He made between you love and affection. Indeed, in that there are signs for people who think.\(^4\)

Law No. 1 of 1974 is a regulation that regulates marriage in Indonesia which applies as one of the legal products to accommodate the aspirations of the community, which is a source of material law for marriage. UU no. 1 of 1974 Article 1 explains that "Marriage is an inner and outer bond between a man and a woman as husband and wife with the aim of forming a happy and eternal family (household) based on Belief in One Almighty God".\(^5\) And marriage in Presidential Instruction No. 1 of 1991 concerning KHI stated that "Marriage according to Islamic law is a marriage, namely a very strong contract or mitzaqan ghaliza to obey Allah's commands and carrying it out is worship".\(^6\)

UU no. 1 of 1974 Article 63, states that problems that occur between Muslims regarding marriage can be resolved in the Religious Courts, while the duties and authorities of the Religious Courts as stated in Law no. 50 of 2009 is concerning; marriage, inheritance, testaments, grants, endowments, zakat, ifaq, shadaqah and sharia economics. Apart from this authority, Article 52A of Law no. 3 of 2006, the Religious


\(^2\)Ministry of Religion of the Republic of Indonesia, the Qur'an and its Translation (Revised Edition; Surabaya: Mahkota, 1989), h. 862


\(^4\)Ministry of Religion of the Republic of Indonesia, the Qur'an and its Translation (Revised Edition; Surabaya: Mahkota, 1989), h. 644

\(^5\)Republic of Indonesia, Law no. 1 of 1974 concerning Marriage, Article 1.

\(^6\)Republic of Indonesia, Presidential Instruction No. 1 of 1991 concerning KHI, Article 2.
Courts gave the testimony of ru'yat al-hilāl in determining the beginning of the month in the Hijriyah year, Qibla direction and prayer times.

Regarding marriage cases that can be resolved in the Religious Courts, it is stated in detail in the elucidation of Law no. 7 of 1989 concerning the Religious Courts, one of which is the dispensation of marriage for prospective brides who do not meet the age standard according to the provisions of Law no. 16 of 2019 concerning Amendments to Law no. 1 of 1974 Article 7 paragraph (1), the substance of which changes are related to the age limit for marriage.

Ideally, marriages are carried out in accordance with existing regulations, but there are still opportunities provided by the state for the bride and groom and the families/guardians of the prospective bride who still wish to enter into underage marriages. Based on the data we obtained from the Enrekang Religious Court, every year there has always been an increase in marriage dispensation cases being handled in the last 4 years. In 2017 the number of cases received was 35 cases then in 2018, cases received were 36 cases. However, in 2019 there was a surge in cases of 42 cases, this was the impact of the enactment of Law no. 16 of 2019 according to the data we obtained from the Religious Courts that the number of cases that came in after the enforcement of these rules was 17 cases (mid-October - December 2019). In 2020 (as of July 10 2020) a total of 70 cases have been accepted.

Before making a decision, the judge must consider what is in the evidence through the evidence submitted by the litigants and also the judge must listen to the statements of the parties because the judge may not only listen to one party, but all parties must have their statements heard. The judge's consideration is needed in order to reach a decision that has an appropriate legal basis and reflects the values of justice, truth, mastery of law, facts, ethics and morals of a judge. Evidence and conclusions in examining a marriage dispensation application are very important as judges consider in making a decision.

B. Formulation of the problem

Based on the description of the discussion of the background above, what will be studied in more depth from this research is how the dynamics of the judge's considerations in the marriage dispensation decision at the Enrekang Religious Court with the following sub-problems:
1. How is the social conflict in changing the marriage dispensation law?
2. What factors are considered by the judge in determining the dispensation of marriage?
3. What is the dynamics of the judge's considerations in determining the dispensation of marriage?

2. METHOD

This research is a type of field research (field research). Swhile the method used in this study is a qualitative research method. The approach method used is a normative juridical and sociological juridical approach which aims to obtain empirical legal knowledge by going directly to the object, namely knowing social conflict in changes to the legal changes in determining marriage dispensation cases, what factors are considered by judges in deciding marriage dispensation cases, and the dynamics of judge considerations in determining marriage dispensation cases at the Enrekang Religious Court.

The paradigm used in this study is constructivist because this study uses several theories as reference material which will enrich the knowledge of researchers before going into the field. And will help researchers obtain an overview of the dynamics of judges' considerations in determining the dispensation of marriage at the Enrekang Religious Court.
3. RESULT AND DISCUSSION

A. Social Conflict in Changes to the Law on Marriage Dispensation

Conflict can arise from the condition of the plurality of social structures and conflict is a phenomenon that often occurs throughout the process of human life. Conflict cannot be separated from social life. Human life in reality wherever and whenever there are always differences in attitudes, opinions, behaviors, goals and needs that are always contradictory so that such a process will lead to a change.\(^7\)

In general, conflicts are motivated by differences. Meanwhile, the difference itself is an inseparable part of the reality of human life. Differences can be a potential or vice versa can be a problem. It becomes a potential if properly understood and managed constructively so as to further enrich the meaning of human life. It could become a problem if it then develops into a form of settlement by means of violence and/or in a way that is not in line with the applicable regulations. Conflict can also have a positive value, when conflict can be managed wisely and wisely, here conflict can color the social process and is constructive for social change in society and does not bring violence, so that conflict can be interpreted as a source of change.\(^8\)

Conflict can be born from differences brought by each individual in an interaction. These differences include physical characteristics, intelligence, knowledge, customs, beliefs, and so on. With the individual characteristics that are carried over into social interaction, conflict is a natural situation in every society and not one society has never experienced conflict between community members or with other community groups, conflict will only disappear along with the loss of the community itself.

As is the case in regulations relating to marriage, especially those governing the age of marriage for prospective husband and wife. The age limit for marriage based on considerations for the benefit of the family and household as stated in KHI Article 15 and in the General Elucidation of Law no. 16 of 2019 states that the age limit referred to is considered mature physically and mentally to be able to enter into a marriage so that the goal of marriage can be realized properly without ending in divorce and to produce healthy and quality offspring. It is also hoped that increasing the age limit higher than 16 years for women to marry will result in lower birth rates and reduce the risk of maternal and child mortality. Apart from that, children's rights can also be fulfilled so as to optimize children's growth and development including assisting parents and providing children's access to education as high as possible.

Of course, social facts have many roles in limiting the age of marriage for prospective brides and grooms. The number of cases of early marriages that end tragically is enough to provide aspirations for the urgency of limiting the age of marriage. The age limit provisions in Law no. 16 of 2019 changes to Law no. 1 of 1974 Article 7 Paragraph 1 states that marriage is only permitted if the man and woman have reached the age of 19 years.

Normatively changes to the minimum age of marriage for prospective brides as stipulated in Law no. 16 of 2019 concerning changes to Law no. 1 of 1974 is 19 years which is equivalent to the age of marriage for prospective grooms. Thus Law no. 1 of 1974 article 7 paragraph 1 is no longer valid, this is in line with one of the principles of legal preference, namely \textit{lex posterior derogat legi priori}. According to Peter Mahmud Marzuki, that the principle of \textit{lex posterior derogat legi priori}, namely the latest

\(^7\)Sabian Uthman, Fundamentals of Sociology of Law The Meaning of Dialogue between Law & Society (Yokyakarta: Student Library, 2009), h. 186.

\(^8\)Abdul Jamil Wahab, Management of Religious Conflict. Background Analysis of Actual Religious Conflict (Jakarta: Elex Media Pomputindo Kompas-Gramedia, 2014), h. 16.
regulation overrides the previous regulation with the provision that what is being faced are two regulations that hierarchically have the same degree.\(^9\)

The principle of legal preference *lex posterior derogat legi priori* has been implemented in the Enrekang Religious Court. This legal change has also led to an increase in requests for dispensation from marriage at the Enrekang Religious Court. According to the data we have obtained, the number of marriage dispensation cases from January to July 10, 2020 has received 70 applications. Very much increased compared to before the enactment of Law no. 16 of 2019, in 2017 there were 35 cases, in 2018 there were 35 cases and in 2019 there were 42 cases (including 17 cases after the enactment of Law No. 16 of 2019 which began on October 16 2019).

The discrepancy between the applicant's expectations and the failure to grant the application for marriage dispensation by the Enrekang Religious Court in accordance with the Enrekang Religious Court's Marriage Dispensation Stipulation indicates that there is a social conflict contained in the stipulation. If the request is not granted, the applicant still marries her child with her future husband but is not registered at the Sub-District Office of Religious Affairs or married in an unregistered manner which will have a social impact on both (husband/wife) because there is no recognition from the state, constraints in managing population administration and so on. other.

**B. Factors Considered by Judges in Determining Marriage Dispensation**

Disputes or cases that are examined and tried by judges require appropriate decisions to be made. Judges are required to be able to process and process the data and facts that are in court, both in the form of documentary evidence, witnesses, allegations, confessions and oaths. Thus the decisions taken are truly based on a sense of responsibility, fairness, discretion, professionalism and are objective.

Judges may not make a decision on a case before hearing statements from both parties to the case simultaneously, selecting, saying, and examining the evidence available to each of them. UU no. 48 of 2009 Article 5, states that in deciding a case the most important thing is the legal conclusion of the facts revealed at trial. Thus a judge must explore the legal values and sense of justice contained in society.

The basis of a judge in deciding a case, or a lawyer in conveying his legal view of a case or a legal expert providing information and legal reasoning is a process of finding reasons known as legal reasoning which can be interpreted as a consideration in deciding a case/case.\(^10\) In deciding a case, the judge must be based on various considerations that can be accepted by the parties and not outside the rules of law.

Based on the data that the researchers obtained and the results of interviews with several judges at the Enrekang Religious Court Office and the results of interviews with various parties related to the issue of marriage dispensation or early marriage, it can be stated that several factors are considered by judges in determining the dispensation of marriage, both related with the judge who examines and adjudicates the case of the application for marriage dispensation as well as from the person being applied for the marriage dispensation, namely: psychological, health factors, educational factors, economic factors and socio-cultural factors.

a. Psychological factors

Psychological factors of the prospective bride and groom greatly determine a person's readiness to carry out the marriage. Psychological factors are factors that


become the main consideration for a judge in deciding whether to reject or grant a marriage dispensation request.

b. Health Factors

Early marriage has an impact on girls' reproductive health, from a physical point of view, adolescents are not yet strong, their pelvic bones are still too small so that it can endanger the birth process. Girls aged 10-14 years have a five times greater risk of dying during pregnancy or childbirth compared to women aged 20-25 years, while girls aged 15-19 years have twice as likely to die.

This is what causes the judge to make the health factor one of the considerations in examining and determining cases of marriage dispensation as in the determination of marriage dispensation at the Enrekang Religious Court. The data and results of interviews and analysis show that the health factor is also a judge's consideration in determining a marriage dispensation case at the Enrekang Religious Court, whether it ends positively or is accepted or negative or rejected.

c. Educational Factor

The risk of early marriage is the possibility of cessation of education for children who should still be able to continue their education to a higher level which will provide sufficient provisions before marriage for a better future and parents are obliged and responsible for managing, nurturing, educating and protecting children and growing children according to their abilities, interests and talents and preventing marriage at an early age. Education is one of the judges' considerations in determining the dispensation of marriage at the Enrekang Religious Court.

d. Economic Factor

Financial ability is one of the supporting factors in the harmony of husband and wife in a household. If there is no financial capacity, it will become a burden for the head of the family and family members in carrying out their daily lives. One of the sources or triggers of quarrels (many risks of fighting) is the economic factor. And this factor is one of the judges' considerations in determining the marriage dispensation case at the Enrekang Religious Court.

The description and analysis of the factors considered by the judges in determining the dispensation for marriage at the Enrekang Religious Court, as stated above, indicates that considerations from a maslahah perspective on the cases handled are of great concern to the judges before making a final determination or decision.

The description above illustrates that the factors considered by judges in determining the dispensation of marriage at the Enrekang Religious Court are psychological factors, health factors, educational factors and economic factors. These four factors are taken into consideration by the judges in determining the marriage dispensation as stated by the judges during the interview and contained in the determination of the marriage dispensation.

C. Dynamics of Judge Considerations in Determining Marriage Dispensation

Law No. 48 of 2009 Article 5, states that in deciding a case the most important thing is the legal conclusion of the facts revealed at trial. Thus a judge must be able to explore legal values and a sense of justice contained in society.

The basis of a judge in deciding legal cases, or a lawyer in conveying his legal views on a case or a legal expert providing information and legal reasoning is a process of finding reasons known as legal reasoning which means as a consideration in deciding
cases/cases.¹¹ In deciding cases, judges must be based on various considerations that can be accepted by the parties and do not depart from legal principles.

Judges must try to mobilize all their abilities so that every decision handed down contains the values of justice, benefit and certainty. Instead of the other way around, the judge's decision actually created unrest and chaos among the people, especially for justice seekers.

1. Not Generating New Cases

The purpose of holding a process before the court is to obtain a judge's decision.¹² The judge's decision, which is usually referred to as a court decision, is something that the parties to the case really want or look forward to in order to resolve the dispute between them as well as possible. Because with the judge's decision the parties to the dispute expect legal certainty and justice in the cases they face.¹³

Legal reasoning for judges useful in taking consideration to decide a case that is examined. Before dropping or giving a decision, a judge must pay attention and make every effort to make sure that the decision to be handed down will not give rise to new cases. Thus the decision, in this case the determination of the dispensation of marriage as a product of the Religious Courts, is expected to fulfill a sense of justice, benefit and legal certainty for the community.

2. Judge's Position in Decision Making

The judge's decision is the "crown" as well as the "culmination" and "concluding deed" as a reflection of the values of justice, truth, mastery of law and facts, ethics and morals of the judge concerned which is the vision of the judge in deciding cases.¹⁴ Abdul Manan stated that the decision is the final conclusion drawn by the Panel of Judges who are authorized to do so in resolving a dispute between the disputing parties and pronounced in an open session which is open to the public.¹⁵

The Panel of Judges is the main axis and plays a central role in making a decision which in principle is a scientific process. The implementation of law in the decisions of the Panel of Judges refers to a certain frame of mind which is built systematically. Doctrine or legal theory plays an important role in guiding and directing the Panel of Judges to formulate decisions that are able to accommodate legal objectives and have quality, namely justice, certainty and legal benefits.¹⁶

The court's decision is a product of the judge's thoughts regarding law, both single judges and panel judges.¹⁷ Handling of marriage dispensation in the Religious Courts after the issuance of PERMA No. 5 of 2019 concerning Guidelines for Trialng Marriage Dispensation Applications, only handled by a single judge. This is different from before

---


¹²M. Nur Rasaid, Civil Procedure Law, Cet. III, (Jakarta; Sinar Offset Graphic, 2003), h. 48.


¹⁴Republic of Indonesia, Law Number 48 of 2009 concerning Judicial Powers, Article 13, Paragraph (2).


¹⁷Edi Riadi, Dynamics of the Decision of the Supreme Court of the Republic of Indonesia in the Field of Islamic Civil Law (Jakarta: Gramata Publishing, 2011), h. 1.
the enactment of PERMA No. 5 of 2019, where it was permitted in the form of an assembly judge.

The enactment of these new rules is an effort to reduce the occurrence of complexity among judges in a panel of judges in handling marriage dispensation cases. This illustrates that there are dynamics in determining the marriage dispensation at the Enrekang Religious Court, the judge's considerations in handling the marriage dispensation differ from one judge to another. Thus, if there are differences in considerations among the judges, it will take a long time to settle the marriage dispensation case.

As the results of the interviews show, the judges differ in responding to the reasons put forward by the parties in handling the marriage dispensation case. As stated by Mr. Slamet, that it is included in its consideration if the applicant has determined the day of his marriage, the funeral money has been handed over, and the invitations have been issued. Meanwhile, according to Mr. Yusuf Bahrudin, he did not take it as a consideration or set aside this reason at all. It is different with Mr. Naharuddin, he is between the two in the sense that he is still taken into consideration but by exploring and exploring the reasons put forward by the parties.

We can see the difference in other judges' considerations if the one who is applying for a marriage dispensation at the Enrekang Religious Court is already pregnant. This was revealed when the researcher conducted interviews with several judges.

The three judges interviewed by the researchers differed in their legal considerations for those who apply for a marriage dispensation if they are pregnant. As stated by Mr. Slamet, that it is included in his consideration to grant the request for marriage dispensation if the person being petitioned for is pregnant. Meanwhile, according to Mr. Yusuf Bahrudin, if the person being requested for dispensation is pregnant, then he does not immediately grant the request. However, there are many things that he considers, including the condition for which the dispensation is being applied for, which is not possible in terms of health, psychological condition, education, and then the economy, so he does not grant the request.

Unlike the case with Mr. Naharuddin who stated that the requests he handled for urgent reasons or those who requested dispensation from marriage while pregnant were all granted. Especially if it has been corroborated by information from the Puskesmas and the man who got her pregnant is also willing to take responsibility.

Based on the data and data analysis, it can be concluded that there are always dynamics in the determination of the marriage dispensation at the Enrekang Religious Court, because the determination of the marriage dispensation differs from one case to another. And judges sometimes differ in giving legal considerations to a case. If there is a difference of opinion among the judges in a panel, voting will be carried out on the case by following the majority vote after going through deliberation. However, after the enactment of PERMA No. 5 of 2019 which states that in the settlement of cases of dispensation of marriage is a single judge, the judge has been given space to decide based on his considerations and beliefs and these provisions have been enforced at the Enrekang Religious Court.

**CONCLUSION**

Based on the results of the analysis and discussion, the following conclusions can be drawn that the discrepancy between the applicant's expectations and the failure to grant the application for marriage dispensation in accordance with the Marriage Dispensation Stipulation of the Enrekang Religious Court indicates that there is a social conflict contained in the stipulation. If the request is not granted, the applicant still marries her child to her future husband but is not registered at the District Office of Religious Affairs (KUA) or married in an unregistered manner which will have a social impact on both (husband/wife) because there is no recognition from the state, constraints in managing population administration and others.
Factors considered by judges in determining the dispensation of marriage at the Enrekang Religious Court are psychological factors, health factors, educational factors and economic factors. These four factors are taken into consideration by the judge in determining the dispensation of marriage.

There are always dynamics in determining the dispensation for marriage at the Enrekang Religious Court, because the stipulation of the dispensation differs from one case to another. If there is a difference of opinion among the judges in a panel, voting will be carried out on the case by following the majority vote after going through deliberation. However, after the enactment of Supreme Court Regulation Number 5 of 2019 which states that the settlement of marriage dispensation cases is a single judge, thereby reducing the complexity in examining and determining marriage dispensation. This provision has been enforced at the Enrekang Religious Court since the date of its stipulation.

**IMPLICATIONS**

As a research that has been conducted within the Religious Courts, the conclusions drawn certainly have implications in the legal and social fields as well as further research. In this regard, the implications are as follows:

1. Theoretical Implications

The results of this study serve as input for judges in the Religious Courts to be more thorough in examining, considering and determining applications for marriage dispensation so that social conflicts and the impact of these decisions can be minimized so as not to cause unrest in society.

2. Practical Implications

The results of this study serve as input for parents not to marry off their children at an immature age or delay the age of marriage in accordance with applicable laws and regulations so that later these children marry at the right time, at a mature age, psychologically, are ready, in terms of the health of the reproductive organs they are perfect, their education is not cut off and they are also ready economically. The results of this study are also expected to be used as a reference for further studies.

**RECOMMENDATION**

1. For the general public; In order to avoid social conflicts both in the determination of the marriage dispensation and in the midst of society as a result of the determination of the marriage dispensation, parents are urged not to marry off their children according to the provisions of the applicable law.

2. For community leaders; it is hoped that community leaders and religious leaders will provide an understanding to the public about the urgency of postponing the age of marriage for minors and the impact caused by marrying at an immature age, immature from a psychological, health, educational and economic point of view.

**REFERENCES**


