Spiritual, Social, and Practical Competencies in Islamic Religious Education Through Performance-Based Assessment

Amiliya Nur Rosyidah[1*], Fatimah Azzahra[2], Indah Aminatuz Zuhriyah[3], Figo Zulfan Alfaraby[4], Ceni Amaliya[5], Akhmad Fatkhul Wahab[6]

[123456] *Pascasarjana, UIN Malang, Indonesia.*
[3] *Universitas Al-Azhar, Kairo Mesir.*   .

Corresponding E-mail: amelpercasi@gmail.com

Abstract

Islamic Religious Education (PAI) learning has so far tended to emphasize cognitive aspects, so that students' spiritual, social, and practical competencies are less authentically measurable. This condition shows the need for an assessment model that is able to describe the real ability of students to apply Islamic values in daily life. This study aims to analyze the concept, urgency, and strategy of implementing Performance-Based Assessment (PBA) as a holistic assessment model in PAI. The research uses a qualitative method based on literature studies through systematic searches of journals, books, policy documents, and relevant research results. Data analysis is carried out using content analysis, critical review, and conceptual analysis techniques to build a complete understanding of the application of PBA to spiritual, social, and practical competencies. The results of the study show that PBA is able to assess students' abilities authentically through observation of worship practices, reflective journals, social projects, simulations, and other performance-based activities. Implementation challenges include assessment subjectivity, time constraints, and teacher readiness, but can be overcome through the use of objective rubrics, teacher training, and technology integration. Thus, PBA becomes a more relevant, contextual, and transformative assessment approach in strengthening PAI learning.

Keywords: Performance-Based Assessment, Islamic Religious Education, spiritual, social, and practical assessment.

Introduction

Islamic Religious Education (PAI) within the framework of national education policy is developed to internalize religious values into students' attitudes and behavior so that the outcomes of education encompass not only cognitive intelligence but also piety, moral character, and worship competence. The latest technical policy of the Directorate General of Islamic Education issued by the Ministry of Religious Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia reinforces these principles through the Technical Guidelines for the Implementation of Summative Assessment for PAI and Character Education and the curriculum/implementation guidelines for madrasahs, which position the assessment of worship skills, attitudes/behavior, and mastery of religious teachings as mandatory components to be considered (Direktorat Jenderal Pendidikan Islam, 2024). These documents provide normative legitimacy for the transformation of PAI assessment models toward a more holistic and contextual format,

including space for performance-based assessment and authentic assessment that measure affective and psychomotor aspects in addition to cognitive ones.

Theoretically, Performance-Based Assessment (PBA) is developed to assess students' actual abilities in real-world contexts, demanding the demonstration of knowledge, skills, and attitudes through tasks/products and continuous observation. This approach is rooted in the concept of authentic assessment introduced by Wiggins and developed in Indonesian educational literature as a holistic instrument, namely integrating cognitive, affective, and psychomotor aspects and encouraging the use of analytic rubrics to enhance objectivity (Rohmadani et al., 2024, p. 38). The HOTS (Higher Order Thinking Skills) theory complements this framework because PBA often requires the use of higher-order thinking skills (analysis, synthesis, evaluation) in completing authentic tasks. This theoretical conception is elaborated and widely used in studies on the development of PAI instruments and general education in Indonesia.

A number of Indonesian empirical studies support the effectiveness of PBA/authentic assessment in the context of PAI and learning in general. Recent studies find that the use of performance rubrics increases student participation and understanding of applicative material, as well as encourages observable worship practices and personal reflection through journals and social projects. Research on the development of PAI instruments, such as the development of rubrics and PBA instruments in several Islamic education and general education journals, also shows that PBA is able to assess aspects of religious practice and attitudes more comprehensively compared to traditional tests, although its implementation requires teacher readiness and valid rubric instruments (Silvia et al., 2024, pp. 69–70). In addition, there are preliminary studies in Indonesia that explore the integration of technology including learning analytics and AI to support performance-based assessment with the aim of improving efficiency and personalized feedback.

Although theoretical support and normative policy exist, field practice shows several real gaps, including: (1) the dominance of cognitive assessment (objective/memorization-based) that still characterizes PAI so that spiritual, social, and practical competencies are insufficiently measured; (2) limited teacher capacity in designing valid PBA rubrics and conducting in-depth observations; (3) time constraints and administrative burdens that hinder continuous performance observation; (4) disparities in technology integration; (5) the potential of AI and learning analytics that has not been systematically utilized due to ethical issues, privacy concerns, and insufficient human resource readiness (Widyanti et al., 2025, p. 7). These gaps indicate that the ideal condition of holistic assessment encompassing spiritual, social, and practical aspects has not yet been fully implemented in current assessment practices in schools and madrasahs. Field studies and literature reviews in Indonesia consistently confirm the recurrence of these problems.

Methodologically and philosophically, educational evaluation research often highlights the gap between norms/guidelines (das sollen theory) and empirical conditions or field practices (das sein theory). In the context of PAI, this debate emerges in two dimensions, namely the normative-juridical aspect in the form of policy documents stating the targets of holistic assessment and religious moderation, and the implementative-empirical aspect regarding the realities of schools/madrasahs that still show limitations in implementation, both in terms of teacher competence and infrastructural support. Literature on educational methodology and policy studies in Indonesia recommends gap analysis between das sollen and das sein as a source of research problems: identifying inhibiting variables and formulating concrete intervention strategies such as developing objective rubrics, teacher training, and ethical technology integration. This argument becomes an epistemological foundation for studies aiming to propose an integrated PBA model for PAI.

Based on normative foundations, theoretical support, empirical evidence, and real gaps between norms and practice, research that specifically develops and tests PBA strategies integrating rubrics and technology (including AI ethically) to assess spiritual, social, and practical PAI competencies becomes urgent. The practical urgency lies in the fact that the results of the research can provide assessment tools directly applicable for teachers and stakeholders (rubrics, observation guidelines, training modules, and ethical data/AI integration protocols), while scientifically, this study fills a gap in Indonesian literature that relatively lacks discussions on PBA integrated with religious competencies and technology in a comprehensive manner. Thus, this study is not only relevant for the development of more authentic and contextual assessment instruments, but also contributes to the discourse on PAI reform oriented toward religious moderation, 21st-century competencies (HOTS), and the ethics of educational technology use.

Methods

This study uses a qualitative approach with a literature study method. This method is carried out by tracing and examining various relevant scientific sources such as books, journal articles, proceedings, and educational policy documents related to Performance-Based Assessment (PBA) in Islamic Religious Education. Literature search is carried out through a combination of manual techniques and digital applications, such as *Google Scholar, Zotero, Researchgate*, and national journal portals (Sinta and Garuda). The main keywords used include performance-based assessment, authentic assessment, spiritual, social, and practical competencies in PAI. The sources obtained were selected based on relevance, scientific quality, and document availability, then organized using a reference management application. The context and the relationship between the facts found in the documents were also considered in the analysis. Through this approach, it is hoped that researchers will be able to obtain accurate and relevant data, which can significantly enrich their understanding of the issues being studied. (Kamila et al., 2024)

Data was analyzed using three techniques, namely: content analysis to find themes and patterns from the literature, critical review to examine the strengths, weaknesses, and gaps of previous research, and conceptual analysis to establish theoretical relationships regarding PBA and PAI competency assessment. The validity of the data is maintained through triangulation of sources by comparing various references from journals, policy documents, and other research results. This approach allows researchers to develop an objective and comprehensive theoretical picture of the application of PBA in the assessment of spiritual, social, and practical competencies.

Results and Discussion

The Performance-Based Assessment (PBA) section is an assessment approach that evaluates students' abilities through real tasks that reflect the application of knowledge, skills, and attitudes in everyday contexts. Unlike conventional assessments, which tend to measure cognitive aspects through written tests, PBA emphasizes the process and results of authentic and contextual activities. In the context of Islamic Religious Education (PAI), PBA is relevant because it allows for a more comprehensive assessment of spiritual, social, and practical competencies. For example, students' ability to perform worship, demonstrate noble character, and interact socially in accordance with Islamic values can be assessed through direct observation, collaborative projects, and self-reflection.

Research by Silvia et al. shows that the use of performance assessment rubrics is effective in increasing student participation and understanding in IRE learning, especially in the

element of Fiqh. The rubric helps teachers assess process and product aspects objectively and provide constructive feedback to students.(Silvia, R. I., et al., 2023) Along with the implementation of the Merdeka Curriculum, the Directorate of Islamic Education (PAI) of the Indonesian Ministry of Religious Affairs has compiled a PAI Learning and Assessment Guide based on Religious Moderation. This guide aims to provide guidance for PAI teachers in designing and implementing learning and assessment that emphasizes the practice of Islamic values in everyday life. The guide covers the principles of learning, planning, implementation, management, reporting, as well as reflection and follow-up on learning and assessment.

Furthermore, the Directorate of PAI has also prepared Technical Guidelines (Juknis) for the Assessment of Student Graduation in PAI and Ethics subjects at various levels of education. These guidelines accommodate changes in regulations related to assessment and graduation, and provide guidance for teachers in assessing elements of material such as the Qur'an, Hadith, Fiqh, Akhlak, and Islamic History. The implementation of PBA in PAI is also supported by the use of technology. Research by Sofyan and Salito examined the development of artificial intelligence (AI)-based PAI learning assessment at MTs Darul Jazil. The results show that AI can improve the effectiveness of assessment by providing objective, fast data analysis and personalized feedback. However, challenges such as ethics, data privacy, technological readiness, and teacher competence in using AI need to be considered.(Anas Sofyan & Salito, 2024)

Thus, Performance-Based Assessment is an appropriate approach for holistically assessing students' competencies in PAI. Effective implementation of PBA requires careful planning, the use of objective assessment instruments such as rubrics, and adequate technological support. This is in line with the objectives of PAI in shaping students who are not only intellectually intelligent but also spiritually and socially mature.

1. **Assessment of Spiritual Competence through Performance-Based Assessment (PBA)**

Discussion Spiritual competence is one of the main dimensions in Islamic Religious Education (PAI) that reflects the quality of students' relationship with God Almighty. This competence includes understanding and appreciating the values of faith, sincerity, honesty, perseverance in worship, as well as gratitude and trust in God in everyday life. Assessing spiritual competence requires a contextual and authentic approach so that the assessment is not only theoretical but also reflects the actual behavior of students. Performance-Based Assessment (PBA) is a relevant and effective approach to assessing spiritual competence because it emphasizes the direct involvement of students in real religious activities, not just answering written questions. Through performance-based tasks, teachers can observe and evaluate the extent to which students internalize spiritual values in their daily actions.(Sulistiyo, U., & Sari, R. R., 2022) The following are ways in which educators can assess spiritual competence through performance-based assessment.

- Observation of Daily Worship

One strategy that can be used is through observation of the mandatory and sunnah worship practices carried out by students, such as praying, reading the Qur'an, or praying before and after activities. Teachers can use assessment rubrics to assess the accuracy, sincerity, and consistency of students in performing worship. This assessment is carried out continuously to see gradual spiritual growth. Andes Balika, in his research, also discusses how a well-managed Islamic school environment can shape students' daily worship habits, including congregational prayers, reading the Qur'an, and daily

prayers with a reward and punishment system to improve students' worship discipline. (Andes Balika, 2024) Supporting this, Khikayah and Heru Prastyo also review students' daily worship activities and habits and their contribution to the formation of discipline, honesty, and responsibility in accordance with Islamic teachings. (Khikayah & Prastyo, 2021). Thus, the practice of observing worship in schools must be directed at forming spiritual awareness and responsibility as an intrinsic character, not just a mere ritual routine.

- Self-Reflection and Daily Journal

    Students are asked to write a daily journal or personal reflection on their spiritual experiences, such as their feelings after worship, challenges in maintaining honesty, or their attitude when facing life's trials. These reflections provide an overview of internal awareness and understanding of Islamic values. Teachers can assess aspects of honesty, depth of meaning, and relevance to Islamic teachings. Gustian, Y.T., et al. in their research also highlight the importance of reflective learning through daily journals and personal reflections that can strengthen students' spiritual values and Islamic character development in depth.(Gustian, Rahmat, & Gusmaneli, 2025) Harahap and Efridawati et al. also explain how reflection in Islamic Religious Education supports the development of spiritual awareness, the integration of religious values into daily life, and the formation of students' moral awareness.(Harahap, 2023). However, based on the researcher's observations, students' reflective practices tend to be descriptive and do not consistently demonstrate in-depth analysis of spiritual meaning. This situation suggests that teacher support needs to be improved so that reflection does not stop at the narrative level of experience but also develops into a process of internalizing values for behavioral change. The implementation of daily journals needs to be directed at strengthening reflective awareness as an instrument for character formation, not just an administrative task.

- Religious Activity Projects

    Teachers can design spiritual projects such as social service activities, sharing food on blessed Fridays, or campaigns to care for others during Ramadan. Activities such as these are assessed based on the active participation, initiative, and sincerity of students in applying the values of sincerity, caring, and piety. As shown in Fitriani's research, religious projects such as social service and caring campaigns are effective in fostering religious awareness and internalizing Islamic values in students' real lives.(Safitri, Ritonga, & Adhasita, 2025) Junita et al. also discussed in their research the contribution of social projects and reflective journals in shaping the religious character of students who are empathetic and care for others.(Bani & Komariah, 2023). However, based on researchers' observations, the implementation of religious projects still faces challenges in the form of varying levels of student motivation, with some students participating in activities due to assignment demands rather than intrinsic spiritual awareness. This situation suggests that the success of religious projects is determined not only by the technical implementation of the activities, but also by the mentoring process and post-activity reflection. The implementation of religious projects must be accompanied by guidance and directed reflection so that it becomes an effective medium for forming authentic spiritual character, not just a ceremonial activity.

- Giving Spiritual Feedback

    Teachers provide feedback not only on technical performance but also on spiritual aspects, such as motivation for worship, sincerity, and patience. This helps students reflect on and improve their spiritual quality. (Harahap, 2023) also discusses the importance of feedback that emphasizes spiritual aspects such as motivation, sincerity, and patience in religious learning. Nurintan Rambe in her writing also explains how teachers provide constructive feedback that strengthens students' spiritual motivation and worship quality as well as the role of teachers as facilitators of strengthening religious values.(Rambe, 2024). Observations show that spiritual feedback is still not provided consistently and systematically, with some teachers tending to focus on outward performance and the accomplishment of religious duties without delving into deeper spiritual meaning. This situation indicates the need to improve teachers' capacity to provide reflective guidance so that students can understand the purpose of worship beyond mere ritual obligations.

2. **Assessment of Social Competence through Performance-Based Assessment (PBA)**

    Social competence in Islamic Religious Education (PAI) includes the ability of students to interact positively with others, show tolerance, respect differences, work together in groups, resolve conflicts, contribute to the welfare of society, and show empathy and concern for others. Performance-Based Assessment (PBA) is very effective in assessing students' social competence because PBA allows for authentic assessment based on activities that involve real interaction with others. Several strategies that can be applied to assess social competence through PBA include:

- Group Cooperation Projects

    One form of assessment that can be used is a group collaboration project in which students are asked to work together to complete specific tasks related to social values, such as sharing religious information, developing religious-based social programs, or conducting charitable activities. Assessment is based on individual contributions within the group, effective communication, ability to work together, and attitudes of mutual respect and appreciation for differences. Alzaiti Bilbina et al. have researched how social competency-based learning that integrates social projects and group work fosters empathy, effective communication, and cooperation among students.(Bilbina, Nadila, Febriayu, & Alfalisa, 2024) reinforce this. Lutfi Rachman & Nurhanifansyah also explain how the effectiveness of project-based learning in PAI increases student engagement, understanding, and collaboration in completing social religious projects.(Rachman & Nurhanifansyah, 2024) However, the researchers observations revealed that the success of collaborative projects depends not only on the task design but also on the teacher's ability to facilitate group dynamics to prevent unequal contributions and dominance among certain members. This suggests the need for increased mentoring and monitoring of group work processes to ensure the values of collaboration are truly internalized.

- Simulation and Role-Playing

    Simulation or role-playing is a method in which students are given the opportunity to play certain roles in realistic social situations, such as helping people in

need, resolving conflicts between friends, or giving advice to others in a compassionate manner. Assessment is carried out by observing the students' ability to empathize, communicate, and solve problems in a manner consistent with Islamic teachings. This has been explained by Hendra Asri Harahap et al. in their research, which shows that role-playing simulations are effective in increasing positive social habits and understanding the values of avoiding gossip and practicing tabayun. (Hendra Asri Harahap, Elisa Wulandari, Fahmi Lestari Prasetiadi, Hana Fauziyah, & Khaila Najwa Saefina, 2025) Even Nissa Zahru Oktavianti in her research has also explained that by using role-playing, teachers can more easily shape social character and empathy, along with contextual learning methods that motivate students.(Nissa Zahru Oktavianti, 2024) From the researcher's perspective, the Simulation and Role-Playing method has strategic strength as a learning-by-experience approach, where students not only understand moral concepts but also experience social dynamics involving feelings and responsibilities. This demonstrates that religious character education must integrate contextual practical activities and ethical reflection, not simply the transfer of normative knowledge.

- Social Activities and Community Service

    Teachers can design community service activities that integrate Islamic social values, such as social service activities, helping people in need, or organizing events that involve collaboration between schools and the community. PBA can be carried out by observing and assessing student participation in these activities, as well as the extent to which they can work with others and apply Islamic values such as caring, mutual assistance, and sincerity. This has also been researched by (Heriyansyah, Yasyakur, Rosid, Surya Ramadhan, & Prasetyo, 2020) who found that community service experience is important in building students' soft skills and social spirit, especially in religious education. Community service activities in Islamic Religious Education (PAI) learning have proven to be an effective means of fostering social awareness, cooperation, and sincerity as part of the internalization of Islamic values. This approach encourages applied, experience-oriented, and sustainable learning in shaping students' character.

- Social Activity Presentation

    Students can be asked to present the social projects they have worked on, such as anti-bullying campaigns, interfaith peace promotion, or other social activities. Assessment is based on their ability to convey messages clearly, touch the audience's hearts, and demonstrate their awareness of social issues around them. This has also been explained by Amiliya and Ali in their research through the implementation of the P5RA curriculum in the independent curriculum, which also uses presentations in social activities for the community in the implementation of P5RA at MAN 1 Kota Malang. (Rosyidah & Ali, 2025) Social project presentation activities have been proven to build moral courage, social awareness, and communication skills based on Islamic moral values. This model is an effective alternative for authentic assessment of Islamic Religious Education learning because it integrates experience, reflection, and strengthening of religious character within a single learning process.

- Reflection and Self-Assessment

     After participating in social activities, students can be asked to reflect on themselves or conduct a self-assessment of their experiences interacting with others. They can reflect on their role in helping to solve social problems, learn from the experience, and plan better actions for the future. This reflection provides an overview of their social competency growth, such as increased empathy, tolerance, and cooperation. This has been examined by Gusmanidar, E. in his writing, which highlights how self-reflection methods can improve students' understanding of Islamic learning while fostering a deeper spiritual awareness. This method encourages students to relate the material to their personal experiences, making learning more meaningful. (Gusmanidar, 2024) Pauzi, A, in his research, has also reviewed the role of reflection in improving students' critical thinking skills and internalizing religious values, which ultimately supports the growth of social competencies such as empathy and tolerance.(Pauzi, 2025) Self-reflection activities following social projects have proven effective in developing empathy, tolerance, and cooperation as socio-religious competencies. The reflective approach supports experiential learning and strengthens the ongoing internalization of Islamic values, making it relevant for authentic assessment of Islamic Religious Education learning.

3. Assessment of Practical Competence through Performance-Based Assessment (PBA)

     Practical competency in the context of Islamic Religious Education (PAI) refers to the ability of students to apply the religious knowledge they have learned in their daily lives. This includes skills in performing religious rituals correctly, the ability to apply Islamic values in social life, and skills in overcoming life's problems with an approach based on religious teachings. This practical competency is very important in preparing students to become individuals who not only understand religious teachings but can also practice them well in real life.(Yusuf, A. M., & Abidin, Z, 2020)

     Performance-Based Assessment (PBA) is a very effective tool for assessing practical competence, because the assessment is based on the actual performance of students in the context of everyday life. In this case, the assessment is carried out by observing the extent to which students can apply the knowledge they have acquired in various life situations that require practical skills.(Rohman, F., & Mujab, M., 2021)

- Assessment of Religious Practices

     One of the most direct ways to assess practical competence is by assessing daily religious practices, such as prayer, zakat, fasting, and other acts of worship. Teachers can design assignments that require students to perform worship correctly and consciously. This assessment is carried out by observing the accuracy of worship, starting from the procedures, intentions, to the sincerity in carrying out each step of worship. For example, in assessing prayer, teachers can use a rubric that evaluates the accuracy of movements, recitations, and the students' devotion in performing worship. The assessment of religious practices such as prayer, wudu, or reading the Qur'an in a tartil manner can also be carried out as part of PBA. In this activity, teachers use assessment rubrics with clear criteria, such as the accuracy of movements, recitation, and understanding of meaning. Widiyarto, A discusses the use of assessment rubrics to measure the skills of worship practices such as prayer and wudu that are appropriate according to Islamic law.(Widiyarto & Inayati, 2023) Reinforcing this, (Yuliani, 2024) also

describes the development of worship practice test instruments that assess the technical aspects and understanding of the meaning of worship comprehensively. Religious practice assessment is an effective approach to realistically measuring students' religious competence. Through the use of performance tasks and structured assessment rubrics, teachers can assess the accuracy of procedures, readings, and sincerity in performing religious practices such as prayer, ablution, and reading the Quran.

- Assignments Applying Islamic Values in Everyday Life

    PBA in practical competencies can also be done by asking students to apply Islamic values in their daily lives. For example, students are asked to write a report or give a presentation on how they apply Islamic principles such as honesty, patience, and mutual assistance in their lives, whether at home, at school, or in the community. This task measures students' ability to connect the theory they have learned with the realities of their lives. As in the research by Afif & Maemoenah, which discusses portfolio assessment as an alternative to PBA to measure the application of Islamic values, including honesty, patience, and mutual assistance, carried out by students in their daily lives through reports and documentation of activities. (Afif & Maemonah, 2022) This method provides a real picture of the internalization of religious values in student behavior and allows teachers to assess character development objectively.

- Life Problem Simulation

    To measure practical competence, PBA can be conducted through life problem simulations that require students to make decisions based on Islamic principles. For example, students are given a scenario involving a moral or ethical dilemma, such as how they should act in a situation where there is an opportunity to cheat on an exam. According to (Nadiatulkhairiyah Nadiatulkhairiyah, Adinda Deswita Putri, & Gusmaneli Gusmaneli, 2024), the application of simulation methods in PAI learning can train problem solving, increase learning activity, and shape tolerance in students. In this simulation, students must demonstrate attitudes that are in accordance with Islamic teachings, such as honesty and responsibility. Assessment is based on students' ability to analyze situations, choose appropriate actions, and explain the Islamic teachings underlying their decisions. As shown by the results of quasi-experimental research in the article (Afif & Rekan, 2024/hal: 173) the use of role-playing methods significantly improves PAI learning outcomes (average N-Gain for the experimental class was 69.73% vs. 59.54% for the control class), making role-playing worthy of consideration as a form of simulation-based PBA. The findings of this study confirm that simulation-based PBA is relevant as a holistic assessment alternative because it combines aspects of knowledge, skills, and character. Simulation and role-playing are worthy of being considered as a primary strategy for authentically measuring students' practical competencies in the context of Islamic Religious Education.

- Practical Project Development and Presentation

    Students may be asked to develop practical projects, such as creating small da'wah programs, campaigns to strengthen religious values in the surrounding environment, or planning activities that support Islamic principles, such as zakat management or community empowerment. As a PBA method, project assessment and performance assessment are presented as instruments that assess students' ability to

produce products as well as their oral presentation (report/oral) and demonstration skills. Therefore, the assessment must be accompanied by detailed rubrics and clear performance indicators (Mildasari, Ali, & Yahya, n.d.). Thus, the project allows for the assessment of students' abilities to design, implement, and present their work in a practical and applicable manner. Skills in planning, collaborating, and communicating ideas clearly will be part of the assessment indicators. Furthermore, according to (Mahbubi & Sa'diyah, n.d.) in a contextual approach to PAI, authentic assessment that includes performance assessment such as project presentations and discussion participation is an important tool in assessing the application of religious values in the context of real life. Critically, the project model assesses collaboration skills, creativity, problem-solving, responsibility, and the ability to convey ideas persuasively as part of comprehensive indicators of religious competency. Therefore, project-based assessment is a suitable primary strategy in PBA because it integrates knowledge, skills, and character into applicable and meaningful learning experiences.

4. Assessment Challenges and Solutions in Implementing PBA in Islamic Religious Education (PAI)

The implementation of Performance-Based Assessment (PBA) in the context of Islamic Religious Education (PAI) in schools presents a number of challenges that need to be overcome in order for this assessment to be effective and optimal. PBA prioritizes the assessment of students' actual abilities in applying knowledge and skills in everyday life. Although this concept offers a more holistic and practical approach, there are several problems and obstacles that must be faced by educators, students, and schools in its implementation. However, each of these challenges can also be overcome with the right solutions.

1. The Challenge of Subjectivity in Assessment

One of the biggest challenges in implementing PBA is subjectivity in assessment, especially in spiritual and social competencies. Assessments of the quality of students' spiritual understanding, intentions, and social attitudes tend to be personal and can be interpreted differently by each teacher. According to (Komalasari Komalasari, Tubagus Maruf Ansori, Siska Siska, Saefudin Zuhri, & Wahyu Hidayat, 2024), PAI evaluation practices in several schools still face problems of subjectivity in assessment. Some of the main obstacles include the lack of evaluation standards, limited professional development programs, and a lack of feedback mechanisms, resulting in PAI teacher performance assessments that are often subjective and unreliable. Such assessments are highly dependent on the perceptions and experiences of each teacher, which can lead to unfairness or inconsistency in evaluation. To overcome subjectivity, it is important to develop clear and structured assessment rubrics that contain indicators that can be measured objectively. For example, in assessing spiritual competence, the rubric can include indicators such as consistency in performing worship, punctuality, or prayer appreciation, which can be observed through daily assignments or student reflection journals. In addition, training for teachers in using these rubrics consistently and fairly is essential so that assessments can be carried out objectively.(Prayetno, I., 2025) According to (Silvia, 2024b) the use of performance assessment rubrics also helps reduce subjectivity by providing clear criteria and defined quality levels. Rubrics provide

clear and objective standards for assessment that can reduce bias and improve assessment consistency.

2. Time and Resource Constraints

The implementation of PBA requires more time than traditional assessments that rely solely on written exams or tests. PBA involves observation, discussion, projects, and hands-on practice, which requires a considerable amount of time to assess each student in depth. Field studies show that one of the main obstacles in implementing PBA/formative assessment in PAI is time constraints in the lesson schedule. Limited lesson duration makes it difficult to implement in-depth formative assessment optimally (Wildana, Zuhdiah, & Darwis, 2024). In addition, the resources needed, such as facilities, classrooms, and teaching aids, are often limited. In many schools, especially those in remote or underdeveloped areas, this is a major problem in the implementation of PBA. (Hariri, Maimun, Toha, & Ridho, 2024) emphasize that limited resources, such as the need for learning media, the cost of outside classroom observation, and the small allocation of PAI credits, are real obstacles to implementing meaningful performance assessment/PBA. To overcome time and resource constraints, schools need to design flexible assessment schedules that allow teachers to conduct observations and provide feedback. This can be done by integrating performance-based assessment into daily routine activities, such as group projects or observing worship during religious education classes. In addition, the use of technology can speed up the evaluation and documentation process. The use of applications or digital platforms to record assessment results and feedback will help teachers save time and resources.(Sari, D., 2023) Thus, planning a flexible, collaborative, and technology-based assessment system is an important step so that PBA can be implemented effectively even under conditions of limited time and resources.

3. Challenges in Assessing Social and Practical Competencies

Assessing students' social and practical competencies, especially in the context of PAI, can be challenging because it involves evaluating students' behavior in real-life situations. For example, assessing students' ability to work together in groups, share tasks, and resolve conflicts wisely depends heavily on interactions between students and the situations that arise in the classroom or their social environment. Therefore, it is very difficult to create consistent situations in which these competencies can be measured fairly and objectively. One solution is to design social simulations or case studies that can assess students' social skills in a structured context. Teachers can give group assignments that require students to collaborate in planning a religious event or project. Assessment is carried out by observing how students interact in teams, how they resolve conflicts, and how they demonstrate Islamic values in their actions. To further enhance objectivity, teachers can involve peers in the assessment process, providing opportunities for students to assess their friends' performance through constructive feedback.(Dzata Mirrota, D., 2024) Critically, this fact confirms that Islamic Religious Education teachers require not only pedagogical skills but also competence in designing behavior-based assessment instruments and systematic observation techniques. The researchers' view is that the use of peer assessment and clear observation rubrics can reduce subjectivity, as they position students not only as objects but also as evaluators providing constructive feedback. Therefore, improving the quality of social assessment depends heavily on the integration of authentic methods, collaborative strategies, and standardized assessment instruments.

4. Variations in Student Backgrounds

Students in a single class have very diverse backgrounds, whether in terms of social, economic, or religious aspects. These variations can affect how they understand and implement Islamic teachings in their daily lives. Some students may be more accustomed to strict worship practices, while others may only have basic knowledge of religious teachings. This variation in background can affect uniformity in assessment, especially in practical and social competencies. To overcome this challenge, teachers need to apply a differentiated approach to assessment. This means that teachers can adjust assignments and assessments by taking into account the diverse backgrounds of their students. For example, for worship assignments, teachers can give students the opportunity to choose the type of worship that is most relevant to their level of understanding, while still prioritizing the fundamental aspects that must be fulfilled. Similarly, in assessing social and practical competencies, tasks can be tailored to the abilities of each student, so that each individual feels valued and motivated to develop.(Manshur, A., & Isroani, F., 2023) These conditions indicate that the implementation of uniform assessments has the potential to create bias, academic injustice, and reduce the learning motivation of students from less religious backgrounds. Therefore, teachers need to develop assessment designs that are responsive to diversity, including task differentiation, choice-based assignments, and the application of assessment rubrics that consider individual development, not just final results.

5. Maintaining a Balance between Process and Outcome Assessment

PBA places greater emphasis on assessing the process that takes place during learning, but there are times when outcome assessment or final achievement is also necessary to measure student achievement. Maintaining a balance between more holistic process assessment and more measurable outcome assessment is a challenge for many teachers. Sometimes, there is pressure to measure more visible results in a relatively short period of time, while process assessment requires time and long-term observation. The solution to this challenge is to integrate process and outcome assessment simultaneously. Teachers can assess learners based on their achievements in daily tasks or long-term projects, as well as provide a more structured final evaluation to see the extent of the competencies that have been acquired. In this case, assessment portfolios can be a very useful tool. With portfolios, teachers can see students' progress over time, observe the development of competencies, and at the same time, give final grades that reflect their overall achievements.(Hasanah, S., & Sukri, M., 2023) This balance challenge demonstrates that an assessment approach that focuses solely on outcomes can potentially neglect the character development and spiritual competency aspects that are the primary goals of Islamic Religious Education learning. Conversely, assessments that solely emphasize the process can face difficulties in producing objective and measurable academic achievement reports that meet school standards. Assessment integration needs to be systematically developed with clear and consistent rubrics at each stage of student development.

6. Strengthening Teacher Skills in PBA Implementation

PBA implementation requires specific skills from teachers in managing classrooms, designing performance-based tasks, and conducting effective observation and assessment. Not all teachers have the same skills in this regard, which can lead to a lack of proficiency in implementing PBA properly. Education and training for teachers

are very important to improve their competence in implementing PBA. This training can include techniques for designing assessment rubrics, how to conduct effective observations, and how to provide constructive feedback. In addition, teachers also need support from colleagues and the school to share experiences and best practices in implementing PBA. (Haryanto, S., 2024) The uneven distribution of teacher competencies suggests that the implementation of PBA can be subject to subjective, inconsistent, and administrative assessments if not supported by adequate professional capacity. This suggests that the success of PBA depends not only on the assessment instrument but also on the readiness and pedagogical literacy of teachers as the primary implementers. The researchers' view is that ongoing teacher training programs, collaboration between teachers through peer coaching, and school policy support in the form of professional learning communities are strategic strategies to address these weaknesses. These efforts not only increase the effectiveness of PBA implementation but also build a culture of reflection and innovation in Islamic Religious Education learning.

Conclusion

The application of Performance-Based Assessment (PBA) in the context of Islamic Religious Education (PAI) is an effective assessment strategy to measure not only cognitive aspects but also the spiritual, social, and practical dimensions of students authentically. Based on the studies that have been conducted, several conclusions have been drawn: Spiritual competency assessment through PBA can be carried out by assessing worship practices, the application of Islamic values in daily life, and the religious attitudes demonstrated by students in the context of learning and daily life. The assessment of social competence can be carried out by assessing student behavior in interacting with friends, teachers, and the environment, such as through group work, social awareness, and attitudes of tolerance and mutual cooperation. The assessment of practical competence refers to the ability of students to directly apply Islamic teachings, for example through worship practices, religious lectures, social projects, and religious activities at school. The implementation of PBA in PAI faces a number of challenges, including limited teacher understanding, administrative burdens, and the readiness of students and infrastructure. However, these challenges can be overcome through teacher training, curriculum strengthening, collaboration between stakeholders, and institutional policy support.

References

Afif, M. N. H., & Maemonah. (2022). PENILAIAN KOMPETENSI KETERAMPILAN BERBASIS PORTOFOLIO PADA PEMBELAJARAN PAI DI MASA PANDEMI COVID-19. *Wahana Islamika: Jurnal Studi Keislaman*, *8*(1), 36–50. https://doi.org/10.61136/w7g4h858

Anas Sofyan, & Salito, S. (2024). Pengembangan Penilaian Pembelajaran PAI Berbasis Kecerdasan Buatan: Peluang dan Tantangan di MTs Durul Jazil. *Al-Qalam: Jurnal Kajian Islam dan Pendidikan*, *16*(2), 236–243. https://doi.org/10.47435/al-qalam.v16i2.3290

Andes Balika, Y. (2024). Pengelolaan Lingkungan Sekolah Islami terhadap Pembiasaan Ibadah Siswa di SMP IT Washilatun Nazah. *Invention: Journal Research and Education Studies*, 35–41. https://doi.org/10.51178/invention.v5i3.2360

Bani, E. A. S., & Komariah, D. (2023). Efektivitas Pendidikan Karakter Melalui Metode Jurnal Refleksi Harian Siswa KELAS III A SDN 262 Panyileukan Kota Bandung. *Journal on Education*, *6*(1), 4492–4498.

Bilbina, A., Nadila, A., Febriayu, N., & Alfalisa, U. Y. (2024). Pembelajaran PAI Berbasis Kompetensi Sosial untuk Meningkatkan Empati Siswa. *Journal of Contemporary Research*, *01*(02), 172–181.

Dahlan, Muh. N. F., Nurqadriani, N., & Firdaus, Muh. N. R. C. (2025). Evaluation of the Performance Assessment System for Islamic School Principals: Challenges and Opportunities in Achieving Quality-Based Education. *IJORER : International Journal of Recent Educational Research*, *6*(1), 1–18. https://doi.org/10.46245/ijorer.v6i1.739

Direktorat PAI. (2024). *Petunjuk Teknis Penilaian Kelulusan Peserta Didik Mata Pelajaran PAI dan Budi Pekerti Tahun 2024*. Kementerian Agama Republik Indonesia.

Dzata Mirrota, D. (2024). Tantangan dan Solusi Pembelajaran Agama Islam di Sekolah Inklusi. *Urwatul Wutsqo: Jurnal Studi Kependidikan Dan Keislaman*, *13*(1), 91–100. https://jurnal.stituwjombang.ac.id/index.php/UrwatulWutsqo

Gusmanidar, E. (2024). *Meningkatkan Hasil Belajar Siswa melalui Pembelajaran Refleksi Diri terhadap Pemahaman tentang Ibadah di SMP Negeri 1 Tanah putih*. *1*(1).

Gustian, Y. T., Rahmat, Z. H., & Gusmaneli, G. (2025). Peran Strategi Pembelajaran Reflektif dalam Menumbuhkan Kesadaran Religius Siswa. *Jurnal Pendidikan Dirgantara*, *2*(2), 54–68. https://doi.org/10.61132/jupendir.v2i2.231

Harahap, E. (2023). Menggali Prinsip-Prinsip dan Model Pembelajaran Pendidikan Agama Islam yang Transformatif: Membangun Kesadaran Spiritual dan Kemandirian Berpikir. *Al-Murabbi Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, *1*(1), 113–127. https://doi.org/10.62086/al-murabbi.v1i1.427

Hariri, M., Maimun, M., Toha, T., & Ridho, A. (2024). TANTANGAN DAN PROSPEK PENGEMBANGAN KURIKULUM PENDIDIKAN AGAMA ISLAM DI UNIRA. *Atta'dib Jurnal Pendidikan Agama Islam*, *5*(2), 71–90. https://doi.org/10.30863/attadib.v5i2.6961

Haryanto, S. (2024). Penguatan Keterampilan Dasar Mengajar pada Mata Pelajaran Pendidikan Agama Islam. *Qosim: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, *6*(2), 306–315.

Hasanah, S., & Sukri, M. (2023). Tantangan dan Solusi Pembelajaran Agama Islam di Sekolah Inklusi. *Urwatul Wutsqo: Jurnal Studi Kependidikan Dan Keislaman*, *13*(1), 91–100.

Hendra Asri Harahap, Elisa Wulandari, Fahmi Lestari Prasetiadi, Hana Fauziyah, & Khaila Najwa Saefina. (2025). Penerapan Simulasi-Role Playing dalam Pembelajaran PAI untuk Meningkatkan Kebiasaan Positif Siswa Kelas VII di SMPN 2 Karawang Timur. *Jurnal Yudistira : Publikasi Riset Ilmu Pendidikan dan Bahasa*, *3*(3), 44–56. https://doi.org/10.61132/yudistira.v3i3.1876

Heriyansyah, Yasyakur, M., Rosid, A., Surya Ramadhan, A., & Prasetyo, H. (2020). Implementasi Pengabdian pada Masyarakat melalui Pedidikan berbasis EcoMasjid

(Studi kasus di kelurahan semplak kota Bogor). *Khidmatul Ummah: Jurnal Pengabdian Kepada Masyarakat*, *1*(1). https://doi.org/10.30868/khidmatul.v1i01.980

Kamila, A. N., Yusniati, N., Irham, M., Hudzaifah, A., Al, F. F., & Nabila, F. (2024). *Menjelajah Lorong Waktu: Pendidikan Islam di Bawah Cengkeraman Kolonialisme Belanda*. *8*.

Khikayah, K., & Prastyo, H. (2021). Aktivitas dan Habituasi Keagamaan Siswa SDIT Nidaul Hikmah. *Jurnal PROGRESS: Wahana Kreativitas dan Intelektualitas*, *9*(1). https://doi.org/10.31942/pgrs.v9i1.4458

Komalasari Komalasari, Tubagus Maruf Ansori, Siska Siska, Saefudin Zuhri, & Wahyu Hidayat. (2024). Efektivitas Evaluasi Pembelajaran Pendidikan Agama Islam Di SD Kosambi Negeri Kosambi. *Karakter : Jurnal Riset Ilmu Pendidikan Islam*, *2*(1), 164–175. https://doi.org/10.61132/karakter.v2i1.401

Mahbubi, M., & Sa'diyah, H. (n.d.). *PENERAPAN PENDEKATAN KONTEKSTUAL TERHADAP MOTIVASI BELAJAR SISWA PADA MATA PEMBELAJARAN PAI*.

Manshur, A., & Isroani, F. (2023). Tantangan Kurikulum Pendidikan Agama Islam di Era Digital. *Edukasi Islam: Jurnal Pendidikan Agama Islam*, *12*(4), 351–360.

Maskur, S. & Hasyamuddin Bin Othman. (2025). Artificial Intelligence and Islamic Perspective in Student Character Assessment. *Nadwa: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, *19*(1), 109–122. https://doi.org/10.21580/nw.2025.19.1.26153

Mildasari, D. A., Ali, N., & Yahya, M. (n.d.). *Application of Assessment in Online Islamic Education Subjects*.

Nadiatulkhairiyah Nadiatulkhairiyah, Adinda Deswita Putri, & Gusmaneli Gusmaneli. (2024). Peran Simulasi sebagai Strategi Pembelajaran PAI dalam Membangun Sikap Toleransi dan Kepedulian Sosial Siswa. *Semantik : Jurnal Riset Ilmu Pendidikan, Bahasa dan Budaya*, *2*(2), 60–65. https://doi.org/10.61132/semantik.v2i2.579

Nissa Zahru Oktavianti. (2024). Peran Guru Pendidikan Agama Islam dalam Mengembangkan Karakter Kepedulian Sosial Siswa SMP di Yayasan Pendidikan Nurul Hasanah Tembung. *Journal Innovation In Education*, *2*(4), 56–69. https://doi.org/10.59841/inoved.v2i4.1872

Pauzi, A. (2025). PERAN REFLEKSI DALAM PEMBELAJARAN PAI UNTUK MENDORONG BERPIKIR KRITIS SISWA. *At-Tarbiyah: Jurnal Penelitian dan Pendidikan Agama Islam*, *2*(2), 160–165.

Prayetno, I. (2025). Tantangan dan Solusi dalam Pembelajaran PAI di Era Digital. *Jurnal Kajian Islam Dan Sosial Keagamaan*, *2*(3), 616–622.

Rachman, L., & Nurhanifansyah, N. (2024). Integrasi Project-Based Learning dalam Pendidikan Agama Islam: Strategi, Tantangan, dan Efektivitas. *Adabuna: Jurnal Pendidikan dan Pemikiran*, *4*(1), 23–34. https://doi.org/10.38073/adabuna.v4i1.2027

Rambe, N. (2024). STRATEGI GURU DALAM INTERNALISASI NILAI-NILAI SPIRITUAL BAGI SISWA. *JOURNAL OF EDUCATION*, *2*(2).

Rohmadani, S., Wahyuningsih, S., & Belawati, A. P. (2024). Penilaian Autentik Mata Pelajaran PAI pada Kurikulum Merdeka di SMAN 1 Sangatta Selatan. *Jurnal Kajian Islam Dan Sosial Keagamaan*, *2*(1), 37–44.

Rohman, F., & Mujab, M. (2021). Internalization of Islamic Values through PAI Learning in the Formation of Student Character. *Al-Tanzim: Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan Islam*, *5*(2), 103–114. Direktorat Jenderal Pendidikan Islam, K. A. R. (2024). *Petunjuk Teknis Pelaksanaan Asesmen Sumatif Akhir Jenjang Mata Pelajaran Pendidikan Agama Islam dan Budi Pekerti*.

Rosyidah, A. N., & Ali, N. (2025). *Implementation of a Religious Moderation Program Through Strengthening the Pancasila and Rahmatan Lil'alaamin Student Profile Project at Madrasah Aliyah Negeri Kota Malang*. *2*.

Safitri, D., Ritonga, J. M., & Adhasita, N. (2025). Strategi Pembelajaran Pendidikan Agama Islam (PAI) yang Efektif dalam Menumbuhkan Kesadaran Keagamaan. *Akhlak: Jurnal Pendidikan Agama Islam Dan Filsafat*, *2*(3), 35–40. https://doi.org/10.61132/akhlak.v2i3.852

Sari, D. (2023). Tantangan Penerapan Pendidikan Islam pada Generasi Z. *Jurnal Pendidikan Agama Islam*, *2*(3), 205–210.

Sholeh, M. I., Habibulloh, M., Sokip, S., Syafi'i, A., Sahri, S., Nashihuddin, M., … Sulistyorini, S. (2025). IMPLEMENTASI EVALUASI PEMBELAJARAN PENDIDIKAN AGAMA ISLAM BERBASIS HIGHER ORDER THINKING SKILLS (HOTS). *Al'Ulum Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 12–26. https://doi.org/10.54090/alulum.639

Silvia, E. (2024a). EFEKTIVITAS PENGGUNAAN RUBRIK PENILAIAN KINERJA (PERFORMANCE) TERHADAP PEMBELAJARAN PENDIDIKAN AGAMA ISLAM (PAI). *Jurnal Penelitian dan Evaluasi Pendidikan Indonesia*, *14*(1).

Silvia, R. I., Sari, E. Y., & Firdaus, F. (2023). Penerapan Rubrik Penilaian Kinerja untuk Meningkatkan Partisipasi Aktif Siswa dalam Pembelajaran Pendidikan Agama Islam. *Jurnal Pendidikan Dan Pembelajaran*, *13*(2), 101–108. Silvia, E., Resmiwal, R., & Khadijah, K. (2024). Efektivitas Penggunaan Rubrik Penilaian Kinerja (Performance) terhadap Pembelajaran Pendidikan Agama Islam PAI. *Jurnal Penelitian Dan Evaluasi Pendidikan Indonesia*, *14*(1), 68–76.

Sulistiyo, U., & Sari, R. R. (2022). Penguatan Nilai Pendidikan Agama Islam dalam Membentuk Karakter Religius Siswa. . . *Ta'dib: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, *11*(1), 55–64. https://doi.org/.%2520https://doi.org/10.29313/tjpi.v11i1.10189

Wardan, K. (2024). *PENGEMBANGAN INSTRUMEN PENILAIAN PENDIDIKAN AGAMA ISLAM*. *18*(2).

Widiyarto, A., & Inayati, N. L. (2023). Penerapan Evaluasi Pembelajaran Tes Dan Non-Tes Pendidikan Agama Islam di Sekolah Menengah Kejuruan. *Munaddhomah: Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan Islam*, *4*(2), 307–316. https://doi.org/10.31538/munaddhomah.v4i2.439

Widyanti, E., Wahyuningsih, S., & Halim, A. (2025). Penerapan Penilaian Autentik Mata Pelajaran Pendidikan Agama Islam Pada Kurikulum Merdeka di SMP Islam Terpadu Bina Insan Muara Wahau. *Jurnal Tarbiyah Kalimantan*, *2*(1), 1–10.

Wildana, Zuhdiah, & Darwis. (2024). Penerapan Penilaian Formatif Pada Pembelajaran Pendidikan Agama Islam Di SD Negeri 02 Kampung Baru. *Passikola : Jurnal Pendidikan Dasar & Madrasah Ibtidaiyah*, *1*(2).

Yuliani, Y. (2024). Instrumen Evaluasi Bentuk Tes Berbasis HOTS Pada Mata Pelajaran Pendidikan Agama Islam. *ISLAMIC PEDAGOGY: Journal of Islamic Education*, *2*(1), 47–56. https://doi.org/10.52029/ipjie.v2i1.204

Yusuf, A. M., & Abidin, Z. (2020). Urgensi Pendidikan Agama Islam dalam Membentuk Pribadi Muslim pada Era Digital. *Jurnal Pendidikan Agama Islam*, *7*(1), 1–12. https://doi.org/10.22219/jpai.v7i1.12345

Zubair, L., Mu Mini, D. A., Kurnia, Z. A., & Bashith, A. (2024). Strategi Inovatif Dalam Pengembangan Evaluasi Pembelajaran Pendidikan Agama Islam Untuk Meningkatkan Kualitas Pendidikan. *Jurnal Pendidikan Indonesia*, *5*(11), 1217–1227. https://doi.org/10.59141/japendi.v5i11.5911